

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: L. Brown, A. Davies, A. Easson, D. Evans, M. Feakins, R. Harris, J. Higginson, P. Jordan, P. Murphy, M. Powell, A. Webb and S. Woodhouse

County Councillor V. Smith attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Denzil – John Turbevill	Commercial Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

None received.

1. Declarations of Interest

None received.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 1st June 2021 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

3. Application DC/2010/00670 - Residential Development of 8 Units Comprising of a 1 Bed Flat, a 2 Bed Flat above Four Car Ports and 6no. Three Bedroom Houses and all Associated Works. Land to the Rear of 34 to 39 Cross Street, off Beili Priory, Abergavenny

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented to Committee for refusal with two reasons. An additional reason for refusal was considered, namely, the applicant's failure to commit to providing the level of affordable housing on site that was required under LDP Policy S4.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- Concern was expressed regarding the poor access into Beili Priory Lane. The provision of additional properties in this location would only exacerbate the access issues.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm

- In response to a question raised regarding the lack of phosphate stripping technology, the Head of Planning stated that water quality was an ongoing issue in respect of the rivers within Monmouthshire. It was noted that currently, we do not have phosphate stripping capability within this area. However, there are ongoing discussions with a view to upgrading these systems.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Harris and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2010/00670 be refused for the two reasons outlined in the report with an additional reason for refusal namely, the applicant's failure to commit to providing the level of affordable housing on site that is required under LDP Policy S4.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	10
Against refusal	-	1
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2010/00670 be refused for the two reasons outlined in the report with an additional reason for refusal namely, the applicant's failure to commit to providing the level of affordable housing on site that is required under LDP Policy S4.

4. Application DM/2020/00762 - Full planning application for the change of use of the visitor centre at Llandegfedd, to allow the building to be used for meetings, functions and events and to extend the opening hours approved under planning permission DC/2012/00442. Llandegfedd Visitor Centre, Croes-gweddyn Road, Coed-y-Paen, Monmouthshire

Application DM/2020/00762 was withdrawn from the agenda to enable discussions to take place involving Gwent Wildlife Trust, Monmouthshire County Council officers, the local Member and the applicant, Welsh Water.

Following these discussions the application will be presented to a future meeting of Planning Committee for consideration.

5. Application DM/2020/00763 - Full planning application for the change of use of the water sports facility at Llandegfedd to allow the building to be used for meetings, functions and events and to extend the opening hours approved under planning permission DC/2012/00317. Llandegfedd Water Sports Centre, Croes-gweddyn Road, Coed-y-Paen

Application DM/2020/00763 was withdrawn from the agenda to enable discussions to take place involving Gwent Wildlife Trust, Monmouthshire County Council officers, the local Member and the applicant, Welsh Water.

Following these discussions the application will be presented to a future meeting of Planning Committee for consideration.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm**

6. Application DM/2020/01076 - Use of existing agricultural Dutch barn for the storage of cars. Clawdd-y-Parc Farm, Parc Road, Llangybi, Usk

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions outlined in the report.

The application had been presented to Planning Committee in April 2021 with a recommendation for approval. However, the Committee had been minded to defer consideration of the application to investigate whether or not the external works to the building required planning consent or were lawful.

Following investigation it was considered that the works to the Dutch barn were lawful and no further action was required. Accordingly, the external works to the building were considered to be lawful through the passage of time and would not have been required to be advertised as part of this current planning application.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- In response to a question raised regarding the reason for imposing a restriction of 13 vehicles only, the Development Management Area Manager stated that Officers had been satisfied that the building could accommodate that number of vehicles being stored as a collection.
- The application site only refers to the building. Therefore, conditions could only be applied to the building, which is the application boundary, and not the surrounding area with regard to the number of vehicles stored on site.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2020/01076 be approved subject to the two conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2020/01076 be approved subject to the two conditions outlined in the report.

7. Application DM/2020/01766 - Retrospective application for amendment to previously approved planning application: DM/2020/00669. Beaulieu Barn, 25 Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouth, NP25 3SD

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm

recommended for approval subject to the five conditions outlined in the report. In addition to these conditions, officers recommended that the details required by conditions two and four are provided prior to approval and agreed by the Delegation Panel and that these conditions become compliance conditions only.

Mr. R. Hatton, an objector to the application, had prepared an audio recording which was presented to Planning Committee and the following points were outlined:

- The objector's property borders the proposed new development and he has a clear elevated view of it from the south.
- Along with other neighbours he supported the original planning application in 2016 which was to extend the existing small stone dwelling to give a modern standard of residential accommodation.
- This extension would allow for two bedrooms and a small single storey pitched roof extension to the rear of the property.
- A further planning application DM/2020/00669 for minor amendments to the original application was approved in July 2020.
- The planning report indicated an increase in the ridge height of the single storey extension to the rear to match the main building ridge height. No mention of an increase in overall main building ridge height was made in the narrative or the addition of a skylight to the front of the building.
- The submitted plans were not clear and it was difficult to read the various measurements.
- It was not possible to accurately gauge the true extent of these minor alterations.
- The current retrospective planning application has been issued to reflect the dimensions and features of the completed building which are considered to be in breach of the two planning consents.
- The majority of the local objectors consider that the building scale is wrong for the position that it occupies.
- Its appearance is at odds with the existing dwellings in its near vicinity.
- The immediate neighbouring cottages are of white painted brick or stone construction and have an appropriate amount of glazing.
- This building is visible from a number of neighbouring homes and the various footpaths that cross the property does not fit well into the landscape or existing architectural styles.
- Due to the increased roof height of nearly a metre, the building dominates the landscape and degrades the visual amenity.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm

- The amount of glazing was excessive and does not blend in sympathetically with the existing landscape. There is no similar building like it on the Kymin.
- In respect of the additional two storey gable extension, this reinforces the feeling of a gratuitous and unnecessary addition and does nothing to add to the charm of the building.
- This part of the Kymin, with the Offa's Dyke National Trail, can give visitors their first impressions of the Kymin. It is important that any new development blends in well with the existing dwellings in the immediate vicinity.
- The Kymin is located within an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB). The Wye Valley AONB Office and Monmouth Town Council have both objected to this planning application.
- For the reasons given the objector urged the Planning Committee to refuse this planning application.

The applicant's neighbour Mr. D. Edge, had prepared a video recording in support of the application which was presented to Planning Committee and the following points were outlined:

- The neighbour has lived on the Kymin for 30 years and has no business or financial relationship with the applicant.
- The applicant's house is a three bedroomed property. All of the houses on the Kymin vary in size from two to six bedrooms.
- Therefore, a large three bedroomed house is in keeping with the size of properties on the Kymin.
- The applicant's property is made from natural Kymin stone with an oak frame and larch planking and a natural slate roof. It is very much in keeping with the surrounding area as a rural property.
- The property is located on the edge of the settlement and is not particularly prominent and is surrounded by hedges. Whilst it is overlooked by a few properties, they are some distance away.
- One of the issues raised is the second gable on the rear of the property. The work had been undertaken by the applicant under permitted development legislation based on technical guidance from Welsh Government and had been confirmed by Monmouthshire County Council's Planning Department. Unfortunately, the technical guidance from Welsh Government was incorrect but by the time this had been identified the applicant had already ordered the oak frame which had been manufactured, making it difficult at that time to change the structure.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm

- The property is an attractive building in a six acre site and is in keeping with the locality.

Having received the report and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The property was considered to be an improvement on what was originally in place on the site.
- In response to a question raised regarding conditions to remove permitted development rights, the Development Management Area Manager stated that this matter refers to a condition relating to lighting which comes under a separate part of the general permitted development order. The previous inspector's decision had overturned a previous condition that removed part 1 which covered extensions and alterations and other minor improvements under permitted development. As this is a householder application it is not presented to Committee to remove Part 1 again via a separate condition for Part 1. However, due to the manner in which the building has already been extended, as well as it being located within the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, the amount it could be extended further under Part 1 permitted development rights is limited.
- Ecological enhancements and soft landscaping details would be provided prior to release of the decision notice and agreed via the Delegation Panel so that these conditions could be written as compliance conditions, rather than as indicated in the report of the application.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb that application DM/2020/01766 be approved subject to the five conditions outlined in the report. In addition to these conditions, ecological enhancements and soft landscaping details would be provided prior to release of the decision notice and agreed via the Delegation Panel so that these conditions could be written as compliance conditions, rather than as indicated in the report of the application.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	11
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2020/01766 be approved subject to the five conditions outlined in the report. In addition to these conditions, ecological enhancements and soft landscaping details would be provided prior to release of the decision notice and agreed via the Delegation Panel so that these conditions could be written as compliance conditions, rather than as indicated in the report of the application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at County Hall, Usk with Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 6th July, 2021 at 2.00 pm**

8. FOR INFORMATION - The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals Decisions Received:

8.1. Appeal decision - Lingfield, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Caldicot

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at Lingfield, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Caldicot on 1st June 2021.

We noted that the appeal had been allowed and planning permission was granted for front and rear extensions with detached garage at Lingfield, Five Lanes, Caerwent, Caldicot, NP26 5PQ, in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref: DM/2020/01858 dated 14 December 2020, subject to conditions.

8.2. Appeal Decision - Land adjacent St. Teilo's Church, Llantilio Pertholey

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at land adjacent St. Teilo's Church, Llantilio Pertholey on 5th May and 1st June 2021.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

8.3. Cost Decision - Land adjacent St. Teilo's Church, Llantilio Pertholey

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to a costs decision following a site visit that had been held on 5th May and 1st June 2021.

We noted that the application for a full award of costs was refused. The application for a partial award of costs was allowed.

The meeting ended at 3.09 pm.